

No. 44287 /LGH  
To

dated Lahore the 20-6 2017


The Secretary,  
Health Department,  
Govt. of the Punjab, Lahore

Attention: **Mr. Abdul Wahab**  
(Focal Person) PPRA Website,  
Health Department,  
Govt. of the Punjab, Lahore.

Subject: **MINUTES OF GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE MEETING.** *Dated 15-5-2017*

With reference to the subject cited above.


It is therefore kindly requested to issue instruction to the focal person of PPRA Website to upload the minutes of Grievance Committee at official PPRA Website for the Medical equipments and others items through ADP schemes for this hospital (Minutes attached).

  
Medical Superintendent  
Lahore General Hospital  
Lahore

No. \_\_\_\_\_ /LGH dated Lahore the \_\_\_\_\_ 2017

A copy is forwarded for information to the:-

1. Principal, PGMI/ LGH, Lahore.
2. AMS (Equip), LGH, Lahore.

  
Medical Superintendent  
Lahore General Hospital  
Lahore

**Minutes of Grievance Committee**

1. Grievance committee meeting was held on 15-05-2017, under the chairmanship of Prof. Dr. Muhammad Moin, Prof. of Ophthalmology to resolve the grievances submitted by the firms, for the purchase of medical equipment through ADP Scheme PINS Phase-III and Regular Budget.

2. Following committee members attended the meeting:

- ✓ Prof. Dr. Farah Shafi, Prof. of Medicine
- Prof. Dr. Muhammad Anwar Chaudry, Prof. of Neurosurgery
- ✓ Prof. Dr. Farhat Naz, Prof. of Gynae & Obs.
- ✓ Dr. Sikandar Hayyat Gondal, Prof. of Surgery
- Dr. Yawar Sajjad, Assistant Prof. Plastic Surgery *Yawar*

3. The following items were discussed:-

Sr #	Name of Equipment	Name of Firm/ Make & Model	Remarks of the Grievance Committee	Decision of Committee
1	ECG Machine	M/S Radiant Medical	<p><b>Representation of M/S Radiant against the quoted model of M/S KASBN International</b>                      The committee called the representative of the firm to explain their grievance. He informed that M/S KASBN International offered model is originally from ECGMAC company, China and its website address is www. ecgmac.com Model # EM-1201.                      The committee found that Lumed Italy has proper documentation and quality assurance certificates indicating their validity to market their product. Hence the grievance of the firm is not accepted.</p>	Grievance of the firm not accepted.
			<p><b>Representation of M/S Radiant against the quoted model of M/S Biotech Services</b>                      The committee called the representative of the firm to explain their grievance. He informed that the quoted model from M/S Biotech Services is not in compliance with specifications as Twelve channel ECG on at least 5 inches LCD display whereas their offered model shows only three channel ECG on the display.                      The committee found that quoted model of M/S Biotech Services does not meet requirement of specifications, Hence grievance of firm against M/S Biotech Services is accepted and the offer of M/S Biotech Services is declared as non responsive.</p>	Grievance of the firm accepted and the offer of M/S Biotech Services is declared as Non Responsive.
		M/S Biotech Services	<p><b>Representation against the offered model of M/S Radiant Medical.</b>                      The committee called the representative of the firm to explain their grievance. He informed that M/S Radiant Medical has quoted ECG machine Model CP-150 which is following deficiencies in their offer.                      - They have quoted FOR rates but you required C&amp;F rates.                      - Their quoted model does not has facility to display 12 channels ECG, Please clarify from the company.                      The committee found that as per advertisement it was mandatory to quote rate on CIF basis and the firm should quote their rates on CIF basis. Whereas, the firm has quoted their rates on FOR basis. Hence the offer of the M/S Radiant Medical is declared as non responsive.</p>	Grievance of the firm is accepted and the offer of M/S Radiant Medical is declared as Non Responsive.

*Sikandar Hayyat Gondal*      *Moin*      *Farah Shafi*      *Farhat Naz*



Sr #	Name of Equipment	Name of Firm/ Make & Model	Remarks of the Grievance Committee	Decision of Committee
2	Hot Air Oven	M/S Rays Technologies	<p><b>Representation against the offer of M/S Muslim Trading Agencies.</b></p> <p>The committee called the representative of the firm to explain their grievance. He informed that M/S Muslim Trading Agencies has quoted Hot Air Oven Model: ED-56, Binder, which is not as per specification i.e. Fan in oven &amp; door with glass window etc. Therefore it is requested to reject the offer of M/S Muslim Trading Agencies.</p> <p>The committee asked the representative of M/S Muslim Trading to respond to the grievance against them. They could not satisfy the committee with their answer. Hence the offer of M/S Muslim Trading is declared as Non Responsive.</p>	Grievance of the firm is accepted and the offer of M/S Muslim Trading Agencies is delared as Non Responsive.
3	Incubator	M/S Muslim Trading Agencies, BD-115, Binder, Germany	<p>The committee called the representative of the firm to explain their grievance. He informed that our quoted model BD-115, Binder, Germany, is 100% as per required specifications. Kindly consider us responsive.</p> <p>The committee informed the representative of the firm that their firm was declared non responsive on knockout clauses as well as technical deviations and as per bidding documents, your firm was responsible to follow the terms &amp; conditions mentioned in the bidding documents and documents should be attached with the bid and can not be accepted on later stage. Hence, the decision of the TAC stands valid.</p>	Grievance of the firm not accepted.
4	ICU Ventilator 29-10-2016 & 21-12-2016	M/S Eastern Medical, eVent Inspiration 7i, eVent Medical, USA and DK 50 DE, Ekom, Slovak Republic	<p>The committee called the representative of the firm to explain their grievance. He informed that since only one LC will be opened for this bid thus warranty given by manufacturer for whole goods package should be considered. The representative of the firm also informed that there have been no problems reported for quoted products in Pakistan region and manufacturer has taken responsibility for ensuring proper functioning of items worldwide as according to FDA rules and their FDA 510K certificate stands valid.</p> <p>The committee decided that the Principal, AMC/ PGMI/ Lahore Genreal Hospital is requested to constitute a committee consisting of following members for the demonstration of quoted model of all three firms i.e. M/S Vertex Medical, M/S Shirazi Trading and M/S Eastern Medical:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Dr. Rakhshanda Ambreen, AMS (Equipmentnt) Convener</li> <li>- Dr. Naila Asad, Associate PProf. of Anesthesia, Head of Anesthesia Department unit-II, KEMU/ Mayo Hospital, Lahore Member</li> <li>- Dr. Liaqat Ali, Associate Prof. of Anesthesia, AIMC/ Jinnah Hospital, Lahore Member</li> <li>- Prof. Dr. Jodat Saleem, Prof. of Anesthesia, PGMI/ LGH Member</li> <li>- Dr. Faisal Javed, DMS (ADP Purchase) Member</li> <li>- Mr. Zia ul Haq, T.O Health Department Member</li> <li>- Mr. Awais Bin Tariq, ECC/ Biomedical Engineer, PGMI/ LGH Member</li> </ul> <p>The committee is requested to submit the report in grievance committee to proceed further in the matter.</p>	Decision Pending

Sr *	Name of Equipment	Name of Firm/ Make & Model	Remarks of the Grievance Committee	Decision of Committee
4	Neuro-navigation System	M/S Oriental Sales Corporation Scopis Neuronavigation system, Scopis GmbH, Germany	Incharge Purchase cell informed the committee that last grievance committee meeting was held on 09-03-2017 and it was decided that the Principal, AMC/ PGMI/ Lahore General Hospital, Lahore is requested to constitute a committee consisting of odd members to re evaluate the offers in the presence of the participating firms and the committee will submit its detailed report to the grievance committee. In this regard, the committee was constituted and meetings were held on 21-04-2017 and 25-04-2017, and evaluated the offers in the presence of the participating firms i.e. M/S Oriental Sales Corporation, M/S Medi Urge and Ontech Corporation. After detailed discussion and going through the offers, the committee found that M/S Orient Sales and M/S Medi Urge did not fulfilled the requirement of bidding documents, hence declared non responsive. Whereas, M/S Ontech Corporation fulfills the requirement of bidding documents, hence declared responsive. Now the institute had received letter vide dairy No. 15339 dated 04-05-2017, which stated that Lahore High court has issued stay order against the procurement of Neuro-navigation, therefore procurement process must be suspended until this matter is resolved. The committee decided that the procurement process is suspended until the decision/ direction of the Lahore High Court.	
5	Echocardiography Machine through regular budget	M/S Shirazi Trading, GE VIVID S70, GE Health Care, USA	The committee called the representative of the firm to explain their grievance. He informed that: - We quoted Vivid S70N and 'N' is for Norway (Country of origin). FDA and CE marked are attached which shows the country of origin. - Agency agreement was attached with technical offer however for particular tender it was missed and now letter of authorization is attached here. - we had already attached list of install base of echocardiography with customer satisfactory reports. On the basis of above clarifications you are requested to technically accept our bid. The committee asked the representative of M/S Shirazi Trading to explain their grievance. He informed that they have applied for FDA 510K certification, Authorization letter was missed and is attached herewith. The committee remarked that your firm was responsible to follow the terms & conditions mentioned in the bidding documents and documents should be attached with the bid and can not be accepted on later stage. Hence, the decision of the TAC stands valid.	Grievance of the firm not accepted.

The committee forwarded the case to purchase committee for further process.

Prof. Dr. Muhammad Moin, Prof. of Ophthalmology

Prof. Dr. Farah Shafi, Prof. of Medicine

Prof. Dr. Muhammad Anwar Chaudry, Prof. of Neurosurgery

Prof. Dr. Farhat Naz, Prof. of Gynae & Obs.

Dr. Sikandar Hayyat Gondal, Prof. of Surgery

Dr. Yawar Sajjad, Assistant Prof. Plastic Surgery

